

COMPLAINTS ABOUT THE JUDICIARY (SCOTLAND) RULES 2014

Made - - - - [] 2014

Coming into force - - [] 2014

The Lord President of the Court of Session, in exercise of his powers under section 28 of the Judiciary and Courts (Scotland) Act 2008 (asp 6), makes the following Rules.

Citation and commencement

1. These Rules may be cited as the Complaints about the Judiciary (Scotland) Rules 2014 and come into force on [] 2014.

Application

2. These Rules apply in relation to complaints about the conduct of the following judicial office holders:—

- (a) judges of the Court of Session;
- (b) re-employed retired judges of the Court of Session;
- (c) the Chairman of the Scottish Land Court;
- (d) temporary judges of the Court of Session;
- (e) sheriffs principal;
- (f) temporary sheriffs principal;
- (g) sheriffs;
- (h) re-employed retired sheriffs principal and sheriffs;
- (i) part-time sheriffs;
- (j) stipendiary magistrates;
- (k) justices of the peace.

Disciplinary judge

3.—(1) The Lord President is to appoint a judge of the Inner House of the Court of Session (to be known as “the disciplinary judge”) for the purposes of—

- (a) supervising the operation generally of these Rules and reporting to the Lord President about that matter as appropriate; and
- (b) carrying out the other functions specified by these Rules.

(2) Paragraph (3) applies to a complaint made under these Rules—

- (a) alleging misconduct on the part of the judge who is the disciplinary judge; or
- (b) where the disciplinary judge considers it to be inappropriate for him or her to carry out the functions mentioned in paragraph (1)(b) in relation to the complaint.

(3) The functions mentioned in paragraph (1)(b) are in relation to that allegation to be carried out by another judge of the Inner House of the Court of Session nominated by the Lord President.

Judicial Office

4.—(1) References in these Rules to the Judicial Office are to the Judicial Office established by the Scottish Court Service to support the Lord President in the Lord President’s non-judicial functions.

(2) Where under these Rules a function is to be carried out by the Judicial Office, the function is to be carried out by the most senior member of its staff or such other member of staff as may be authorised (whether specifically or generally) by the most senior member.

Making a complaint

5.—(1) A complaint may be made by submitting a complaint document to the Judicial Office.

(2) A “complaint document” is a document in writing which —

- (a) is legible;
- (b) contains a detailed allegation of misconduct on the part of a named or identifiable judicial office holder;
- (c) gives the date or dates of the alleged misconduct; and
- (d) states the name and address of the person who is making the complaint.

(3) A complaint document is to be accompanied by all documents within the control of the person complaining upon which the person seeks to rely in making the allegation.

(4) For the purposes of this rule—

- (a) a document may be sent by any method which the Judicial Office has indicated to be an acceptable means of sending it;
- (b) if sent by an electronic means indicated to be acceptable a document is to be treated as adequate only if it is capable of being used for subsequent reference.

(5) A complaint will not be accepted where the complaint document (or any communication associated with it) indicates that the person complaining does not want the judicial office holder against whom the complaint is made to see a copy of the complaint document or any document accompanying it.

Allegations of criminal conduct

6.—(1) This rule applies to a complaint made under rule 5.

(2) If it appears to the Judicial Office that the allegation is of an act or omission which may constitute a criminal offence—

- (a) further consideration under these Rules may be suspended until—
 - (i) the relevant prosecutor indicates that no criminal proceedings are to be taken; or
 - (ii) any such proceedings have been concluded; and
- (b) the Judicial Office is to write to the person complaining to that effect.

Notification of judicial office holder

7.—(1) This rule applies to an allegation whose consideration is not currently suspended under rule 6.

(2) The Judicial Office is to send to the judicial officer holder concerned —

- (a) a document (which may be the complaint document) containing the allegation;
- (b) all information about the allegation which is in or accompanied the complaint document.

Initial assessment of complaint

8.—(1) This rule applies to an allegation once it is sent to the judicial office holder concerned under rule 7.

(2) The Judicial Office is to carry out an initial assessment of the allegation.

(3) If the Judicial Office considers that the allegation falls into paragraph (4) or (5), it is to dismiss the allegation.

(4) An allegation falls into this paragraph if—

- (a) it does not contain sufficient information to enable a proper understanding of the allegation to be achieved;
- (b) it is about a judicial decision;
- (c) it raises a matter which has already been dealt with (whether under these Rules or otherwise), and does not present any material new evidence;
- (d) it raises a matter which falls within the functions of the Judicial Complaints Reviewer.

(5) An allegation falls into this paragraph if the allegation of misconduct contained in the complaint document founds on anything occurring more than 3 months before the date on which the complaint was received, but—

- (a) The person complaining may make a case in writing to the Judicial Office that there are exceptional circumstances which justify allowing the allegation to proceed.
- (b) Where such a case is not made at the time of making the complaint, the Judicial Office is to write to the person inviting him or her, by such date as is specified, to make such a case.
- (c) Where such a case is made, it is to be put before the disciplinary judge and he or she is to then decide whether the allegation is to be allowed to proceed.

(6) Where a complaint is dismissed under paragraph (3), the Judicial Office is to provide written reasons to the person complaining and the judicial office holder concerned to that effect.

(7) Where an allegation is not dismissed under paragraph (3), the Judicial Office is to write to the person complaining, and to the judicial office holder concerned to inform them of that fact and of the next step under these Rules.

Ongoing proceedings

9.—(1) This rule applies where an allegation has not been dismissed under rule 8.

(2) If it appears to the Judicial Office that the allegation relates to judicial proceedings which are not concluded, it is to refer the allegation to the disciplinary judge for advice as to whether it would be appropriate for consideration under these Rules to continue before the judicial proceedings are concluded.

(3) Where the disciplinary judge advises that it would be inappropriate for that to occur—

- (a) no further action is to be taken under these Rules until the proceedings have been concluded; and
- (b) the Judicial Office is to write to the person complaining and to the judicial office holder concerned to that effect.

Consideration by disciplinary judge

10.—(1) This rule applies to an allegation—

- (a) which is not dismissed under rule 8; and
- (b) whose consideration is not currently suspended under rule 9.

(2) The allegation is to be considered by the disciplinary judge in accordance with the following paragraphs.

(3) If the disciplinary judge is of the view that the allegation falls into paragraph (4), he or she is to dismiss the allegation and is to inform the Judicial Office accordingly.

(4) An allegation falls into this paragraph if—

- (a) it does not contain sufficient information to enable a proper understanding of the grounds of the allegation to be achieved;
- (b) it is about a judicial decision;
- (c) it raises a matter which has already been dealt with (whether under these Rules or otherwise), and does not present any material new evidence;
- (d) it raises a matter which falls within the functions of the Judicial Complaints Reviewer;
- (e) it is vexatious;
- (f) it is without substance;
- (g) it is insubstantial, that is to say that even if substantiated, it would not require any disciplinary action to be taken.

(5) In forming his or her view as to whether paragraph (4)(f) or (g) applies, the disciplinary judge is to take due account of the extent to which the conduct concerned complies with any guidance relating to the conduct of judicial office holders issued by the Lord President under section 2(2)(d) of the 2008 Act which is relevant.

(6) Where a complaint is dismissed under paragraph (3), the Judicial Office is to write to the person complaining and the judicial office holder concerned to that effect.

(7) If the disciplinary judge is of the view that one or more allegations in a complaint fall outside paragraph (4), he or she is to go on to consider whether paragraph (8) applies and is to inform the Judicial Office accordingly.

(8) This paragraph applies where the disciplinary judge thinks that the allegation, if substantiated, would raise a possible question of fitness for office.

(9) Where the Judicial Office is informed that paragraph (8) applies, it is to inform the Lord President; and further consideration under these Rules is suspended until the Lord President indicates whether he or she intends to request the establishment of a tribunal to consider fitness for office of the judicial office holder.

(10) In the event that the Lord President indicates an intention to make such a request, consideration under these Rules is to cease; and the Judicial Office is to write to the person complaining and to the judicial office holder concerned to that effect.

Referral to a nominated judge

11.—(1) This rule applies to an allegation—

- (a) which is not dismissed under rule 10; and
- (b) whose consideration is not currently suspended under that rule.

(2) The Judicial Office is to refer the allegation to a judicial office holder nominated by the disciplinary judge.

(3) Subject to paragraph (4), the nominated judge is to be either a judge of the Court of Session or a sheriff principal.

(4) In the case of an allegation falling within paragraph (5), the nominated judge is to be a judge of the Court of Session.

(5) An allegation falls within this paragraph if it is against—

- (a) a judge of the Court of Session;
- (b) a re-employed retired judge of the Court of Session;
- (c) the Chairman of the Scottish Land Court;
- (d) a temporary judge of the Court of Session and concerns the carrying out of a function of that appointment;

(e) a sheriff principal.

(6) Where on initial consideration of the allegation or at a later stage of consideration under these rules the nominated judge thinks that the matter may be capable of resolution to the satisfaction of the person complaining without further investigation, he or she may communicate with the person complaining and the judicial office holder concerned as he or she thinks fit with a view to securing that outcome.

(7) Where that outcome is achieved, the nominated judge is to write to the Judicial Office to that effect and consideration under these Rules is to cease.

Investigation and report

12.—(1) This rule applies to an allegation referred to a nominated judge which has on initial consideration been incapable of resolution under rule 11(6).

(2) The nominated judge is to investigate the allegation and to determine—

- (a) the facts of the matter;
- (b) whether the allegation is substantiated (or substantiated in part); and if so, to recommend whether the Lord President should exercise a power mentioned in section 29(1) of the 2008 Act or take other action.

(3) The report of the nominated judge is to—

- (a) be in writing;
- (b) contain reasons for its conclusions;
- (c) be submitted to the Judicial Office.

(4) In deciding whether an allegation is to any extent substantiated and in making any recommendation in consequence the nominated judge is to take due account of the extent to which the conduct concerned complies with any guidance relating to the conduct of judicial office holders issued by the Lord President under section 2(2)(d) of the 2008 Act which is relevant.

Procedure and conduct of investigation

13.—(1) For the purpose of the investigation the nominated judge may—

- (a) make such inquiries into the allegation as he or she considers appropriate;
- (b) obtain and consider any documents which appear to be relevant;
- (c) interview any persons he or she considers appropriate.

(2) The nominated judge is to—

- (a) give an interviewee reasonable notice of the date and time of the interview;
- (b) permit an interviewee to be accompanied by a person of his or her choosing for the doing of such of the following for the interviewee as the interviewee requires—
 - (i) providing moral support;
 - (ii) helping to manage papers;
 - (iii) taking notes;
 - (iv) offering advice.

(3) The nominated judge may arrange for any interview to be recorded, either by way of taking contemporaneous notes or by equipment which records sound digitally on an appropriate storage medium.

(4) The judicial office holder concerned is to comply with a request from the nominated judge that he or she be interviewed.

(5) The procedure and conduct of an investigation is such (consistent with respecting the principles of fairness and natural justice) as the nominated judge thinks fit; but—

- (a) the judicial office holder concerned is to be afforded the opportunity to submit a written response to the allegation;
- (b) the person complaining and the judicial office holder are each to be afforded the opportunity to submit written comments on any information obtained by the nominated judge which he or she has not previously seen;
- (c) so far as the determination of questions of fact is concerned—
 - (i) the investigation is to be conducted with the aim of ascertaining, so far as reasonably possible, the truth;
 - (ii) findings of fact are to be made on the balance of probabilities;
- (d) so far as possible, the investigation is to be conducted without disclosure to third parties of the identity of the person complaining or the judicial office holder concerned.

(6) Before the investigation starts the nominated judge is to prepare and issue to the person complaining and the judicial office holder concerned a statement of the procedure he or she has been decided on.

(7) Where, after the investigation starts, the nominated judge wishes to depart from that procedure in a material way, he or she is to inform the person complaining and the judicial office holder concerned in writing before proceeding.

(8) The nominated judge is to make a note of the substance of all conversations in the course of the investigation which are material to it and is to create and maintain a file containing—

- (a) those notes;
- (b) all documents relevant to the investigation; and
- (c) all recordings of interviews carried out in the course of the investigation.

(9) After submitting his or her report, the nominated judge is to send the file to the Judicial Office.

Review by disciplinary judge

14.—(1) This rule applies where the Judicial Office has received a report under rule 12.

(2) The report shall be put before the disciplinary judge, together with the nominated judge’s file.

(3) The disciplinary judge is then to review the determinations in the report.

(4) Having reviewed the determinations, the disciplinary judge may require that the nominated judge reconsiders any of them.

(5) Such a requirement is to be in writing and a copy is to be sent to the Judicial Office.

(6) For the purposes of reconsidering a determination, the nominated judge may—

- (a) make such further inquiries into the allegation as he or she considers appropriate;
- (b) obtain and consider any further documents which appear to be relevant;
- (c) interview (or re-interview) any persons he or she considers appropriate.

(7) Rules 13(2) and (3) apply to an interview under paragraph (6)(c) as they apply to an interview conducted under rule 13(1)(c).

(8) The nominated judge is to make a note of the substance of all conversations in the course of reconsideration of a determination which are material to it and is to update the nominated judge’s file with—

- (a) those notes;
- (b) all additional documents relevant to the reconsideration;
- (c) all recordings of interviews carried out in the course of the reconsideration.

(9) Having carried out all reconsiderations required by the disciplinary judge, the nominated judge is to resubmit his or her report.

(10) In relation to any determination which the nominated judge was required to reconsider the report is to contain statements of—

- (a) what the nominated judge did in reconsidering the determination;
- (b) what the outcome of the reconsideration was.

Report to the Lord President

15.—(1) Paragraph (2) applies where the Judicial Office has—

- (a) received a report under rule 12 and the disciplinary judge has indicated that he or she is not requiring that the nominated judge reviews any determination under rule 14; or
- (b) received a report under rule 14.

(2) The Judicial Office is to put the report before the Lord President.

(3) Paragraph (4) applies where—

- (a) the report finds the allegation to be substantiated (or substantiated in part);
- (b) the report recommends that the Lord President should exercise a power mentioned in section 29(1) of the 2008 Act; and
- (c) the Lord President proposes to exercise a power mentioned in that section.

(4) The Lord President is to write to the judicial office holder who is the subject of the report inviting him or her to make representations.

(5) The Lord President's letter is to contain or be accompanied by such information (including where appropriate the report) as he or she considers to be appropriate for the purpose of giving the judicial office holder a fair opportunity to make any representations.

(6) The judicial office holder who is the subject of the report is to make any representations by such date as is specified in the invitation.

(7) The Lord President is to consider any representations before deciding whether to exercise a power.

Notification of outcome, etc.

16.—(1) This rule applies where—

- (a) the Lord President has received a report under rule 15(2); and
- (b) the Lord President has taken all action (if any) which he or she proposes to take in consequence.

(2) The Judicial Office is to write to the person complaining to inform the person of—

- (a) the outcome of the investigation of the complaint; and
- (b) the action (if any) taken by the Lord President in consequence.

(3) The Judicial Office's letter is to contain or be accompanied by such information as the Lord President considers to be appropriate for the purpose of giving the person complaining a fair understanding of the matters mentioned in paragraphs (2)(a) and (b).

(4) Except where the Lord President has already done so in pursuance of rule 15 he or she is to write to the judicial office holder who is the subject of the report to inform him or her of the matters mentioned in paragraph (2)(a) and (b).

(5) After paragraph (2) and (4) have been complied with the Lord President may publish or disclose to any person such information concerning the whole matter (including the identity of the person complaining or the judicial office holder who is the subject of the report or both) as he or she considers to be appropriate.

Withdrawal and deemed withdrawal of complaint

17.—(1) A person complaining may by writing to the Judicial Office to that effect, withdraw the complaint at any time before the Lord President has received a report about it under rule 15(2).

(2) Where a person complaining fails to respond to correspondence from the Judicial Office or nominated judge within a reasonable period, the complaint will be deemed to have been withdrawn and will be treated in accordance with this rule.

(3) Where a complaint is withdrawn before it is referred to a nominated judge under rule 11, the disciplinary judge is to consider whether further consideration of an allegation of misconduct in it is appropriate.

(4) If so, the allegation is to continue to be considered under these Rules as if the complaint had not been withdrawn.

(5) Where a complaint is withdrawn after it is referred to a nominated judge under rule 11, the nominated judge is to consider whether further investigation of an allegation of misconduct in it is appropriate.

(6) If so, the allegation is to continue to be investigated under these Rules as if the complaint had not been withdrawn.

(7) Where an allegation is continuing to be investigated by virtue of paragraph (3) or (5), any requirement in the Rules or in the statement of the procedure decided on under rule 13(6) to communicate a matter to or to seek comments from the person complaining ceases to apply.

Consideration of matters in absence of a complaint

18.—(1) Paragraph (2) applies where no complaint is made under these Rules but the disciplinary judge receives information from any source which suggests to him or her that consideration under these Rules of a possible allegation of misconduct is appropriate.

(2) The allegation is to be considered under these Rules (with the necessary modifications to reflect the lack of a person complaining) as if—

- (a) a complaint containing it had been made under rule 5; and
- (b) rule 7 did not apply.

Ceasing to hold judicial office

19. Except where the Lord President decides otherwise, where a judicial office holder against whom a complaint has been made ceases to hold any of the judicial offices listed in rule 2(1) or dies, consideration of the complaint under these rules is to cease.

Interpretation

20.—(1) In these Rules—

“the 2008 Act” means the Judiciary and Courts (Scotland) Act 2008;

“judicial office holder concerned” means the judicial office holder against whom the allegation is made;

“Lord President” means the Lord President of the Court of Session;

“re-employed retired sheriff principal or sheriff” means a person acting as a sheriff by virtue of section 14A(1) or (8) of the Sheriff Courts (Scotland) Act 1971.

“judicial decision” means any decision taken by a judicial office holder in the course of his or her official duties including: a judgment in a case; a decision as to the conduct of proceedings; a decision as to case management; and, a decision in relation to court programming.

Revocation and Saving

21.—(1) The Complaints about the Judiciary (Scotland) Rules 2013 are revoked.

(2) Those Rules as they applied immediately before [] 2014 continue to have effect for the purpose of any complaint made but not determined, dismissed or withdrawn prior to that date.

Edinburgh
[] 2014

BRIAN GILL
Lord President of the Court of Session